The Current Status of English as a Foreign Language (EFL) Teachers’ Professional Development in Turkey: A Systematic Review of Literature

Rabia Hos¹ and Hatice Topal²

Zirve University, Faculty of Education, Department of English Language Teaching, Kızılhisar Campus, Sahinbey, Gaziantep, Turkey
Telephone: 90-342-211-6666 Ext. 6986
E-mail: ¹<rabia.hos@zirve.edu.tr>, ²<hatice.topal@zirve.edu.tr>

KEYWORDS  English as a Foreign Language, Professional Development, In-service Education and Training

ABSTRACT  With the globalization of the English language as a communication tool and the increased use of technology, the characteristics of learners and teachers are changing. In order to meet the demands of the learners, teachers must keep up-to-date and improve their teaching practices and beliefs, which necessitates professional development (PD) and in-service training for English as foreign Language (EFL) teachers. The purpose of this systematic review was to review the research studies that had been conducted in the area of EFL Teachers’ Professional Development (PD) in Turkey. This meta-analysis reviewed the literature on professional development and in-service training of EFL teachers in journal articles, thesis and dissertations published between 2000 and 2012. A systematic review of literature was performed to examine the current status of EFL Teachers’ professional development. Through the systematic review the methods and results of different research studies were analyzed through a collection of systematic techniques. The results of the study indicate that two broad terminologies has been used in the research literature, many of the studies were evaluative in nature and almost all of them were conducted at English Preparatory Schools at universities. Although the studies had provided many recommendations for professional development, there have been only a handful of studies that examined the impact of PD programs. Through the systematic review, the authors provided recommendations for future researchers and policy-makers.

INTRODUCTION

English has been increasingly growing as a global and dominant language worldwide (Nunan 2001). Parallel to its growth many countries place a great emphasis on the teaching of English. Many countries including Turkey have revised its language teaching policies to meet these demands (OECD 2005). Although there have been numerous reforms to improve the teaching of English as a foreign language, there are many systematic and pedagogical issues to resolve. According to EF English Proficiency Index (EPI) 2012, Turkey ranks 32nd country out of 54 countries based on English language competency. It is evident from this report that despite the educational reforms enacted, learners are not able to reach expected proficiency levels in English Language. There may be many factors contributing to this, including insufficient number of qualified teachers, frequent changes in the curriculum, inadequate resources, lack of continued professional development opportunities and many more.

With the increasing expansion of technology and resources that are available at the fingertips of today’s learners, the demands and needs also change. In order to meet the changing demands of learners it is of utmost importance that teachers renew their knowledge, beliefs and practices in their fields, which is only possible through continued professional training and development. Although a great emphasis is given to the development of English as Foreign Language (EFL) teachers in other countries, there have been very minimal opportunities for EFL teachers’ training and development in Turkey. For example, between the years of 1998 and 2005, out of 3201 in-service education and training (INSET) programs offered by the Turkish Ministry of National Education, 122 of them were for EFL teachers (Kucuksuleymanoglu 2006). These numbers are also evident locally. From the INSET programs offered through the local ministry of national education, there have not been any opportunities for EFL teachers in this southeastern city. It is obvious that teachers are not provided with tools to equip themselves with professionalism.

Professionalism has been referred with various terminology including ‘teacher development’, ‘professional development’, ‘professional
learning’, ‘professional learning community’, ‘training’, and ‘in-service training’. For the purposes of this systematic review, the focus will be INSET and professional development (PD) of EFL teachers in Turkey. Glatthorn (1995) defines professional development as “the professional growth a teacher achieves as a result of gaining increased experience and examining his or her teaching systematically” (p. 41). On the other hand, INSET refers to the educational and training activities that are engaged by teachers, which are often offered by an outside source such as the ministry of education (Gardner 1995).

The terms PD and INSET have been distinguished in the literature. While training has a focus on short-term and immediate goals, development focuses on the long-term growth of teachers (Richards and Farrell 2005). Although the two terms has been distinguished in the literature, they overlap. In order to professionally develop themselves, teachers need to engage in activities that lead to fulfillment of both short and long-term goals.

As a step forward to understanding the current status of INSET and PD of EFL teachers in Turkey, this systematic review of literature is very timely. The aim of this systematic review is:

1. To determine the previously conducted research articles, thesis and dissertations about PD or INSETS of EFL teachers in Turkey
2. To review and discuss the impact and implications of the previously conducted research.
3. To offer recommendations and suggestions for future research in this area.

METHODOLOGY

In order to be included in this systematic review of literature, the studies had to meet the following criteria:

1. Must be an empirical research.
2. Be published between 2000-2012 in a refereed Journal or SSCI and in the thesis and dissertation database of Turkish Higher Education Council (YOK).
3. Include participants from Institutions in Turkey.
4. Include EFL teachers’ professional development or INSET.
5. Must be an empirical research.

In order to identify the studies to be used in this review, several online databases were searched. The search was conducted through using the ERIC (Education Resources Information Center), ISI Web of Knowledge, CSA Linguistics and Language Behavior Abstracts (LLBA), Google Scholar and thesis and dissertation database of Turkish Higher Education Council (YOK). For EFL Teachers’ Professional Development in Turkey, professional development, in-service training, English Language Teachers, Turkey search terms were used. The search function was created by using three Boolean operators: professional development or in-service training and EFL Teachers and Turkey. The search was performed by using the ‘keyword’ function.

All databases were searched for the period of 2000 to 2012 (January 2, 2013). The search resulted in 28 ERIC documents, 11 ISI Web of Knowledge documents, 41 LLBA documents, 23 Google Scholar documents, 75 YOK theses and dissertations. 217 total number of documents were found and examined preliminarily. Through the initial scanning the exclusion criteria was applied. All documents that included PD or INSET of general education or non-ELT fields, pre-service teachers’, settings other than Turkey, and non-empirical studies were eliminated. After examining the abstracts of each study initially, the researchers applied the inclusion criteria to select the studies that could be included within the scope of this study. Through this process 8 journal articles, 22 MA thesis and PhD dissertations were selected for further examination.

Coding Procedures

Due to the limited number of research found in this field in Turkey, the literature was coded through categories and themes. There were two main categories that emerged through participants and setting, which were K-12 schools and teachers or universities and university instructors. From these categories two different themes emerged as being at the forefront of the research in PD and INSET. The two themes emerged by looking at the nature of the research and they were noted as being research that were evaluative or impact research. Each researcher created the categories and codes independently and then crosschecked in regular meetings for con-
stinctness. The following section describes the categories and themes in further detail.

FINDINGS

Through an in-depth analysis of each document found in the literature, it became apparent that there were two main settings and participants in the area of PD and INSET. The settings were either in K-12 grade schools and involved teachers there, or university preparatory schools and instructors there. Within these categories two themes were dominant. Most of the research conducted in the area of PD and INSET were either evaluative in nature or had an impact. These two themes are described below.

Evaluative Studies

From the detailed reading of the documents, each researcher became aware that many of the studies that were conducted in the area of PD or INSET were evaluative in nature. What being evaluative means is that the researchers looked at the perceptions of instructors or teachers regarding PD or INSET. The researchers were not interested in looking at an impact of a specific PD or INSET. The evaluative studies then were thematically aligned accordingly to their participants and setting.

Impact Studies

Another theme that emerged as a result of the detailed review of the research was the studies that had an impact as a result of a specific PD or INSET. What is meant by impact is that through the impact studies researchers were interested in looking at a specific PD or INSET and its impact on the participants and setting. Through this impact, these research led to change at most times, therefore played an important role for the field.

The following tables provide a detailed view of the studies that are included in this systematic review with the categories and themes.

A. University preparatory schools and instructors
   a. Evaluative studies
   b. Impact Studies
B. K-12 Grade Schools and Teachers
   a. Evaluative Studies
   b. Impact Studies

DISCUSSION

In this section we provide an analysis of the studies that were noted in the findings section. As presented in the table in the findings section, the research on PD and INSET in the area of EFL is limited in Turkey. Although there have been more than handful of studies conducted in the area of PD/INSET, many of them focused on gathering information and analyzing the needs of the EFL teachers rather than providing them with effective PD/INSET (Arikan 2004; Turhan and Arikan 2009; Kasapoglu 2002; Karaaslan 2003; Eksi 2010; Sahin 2006; Kucuksuleymanoglu 2006; Buyukyavuz and Inal 2008; Iyidogan 2011; Unal 2010).

The common thread among the ten evaluative studies that were analyzed consisted of similar findings. Eight out of the ten studies reached to the following conclusions (Arikan 2004; Turhan and Arikan 2009; Karaaslan 2003; Eksi 2010; Kucuksuleymanoglu 2006; Buyukyavuz and Inal 2008; Iyidogan 2011; Unal 2010):

1. Teachers believed in the importance/necessity of PD/INSET however did not like to attend.
2. The compulsory manner of PD/INSET also created tensions among teachers that decreased their motivation to attend such sessions.
3. Time constraints and inconvenience of settings also were one of the hindrances to their attendance.
4. Ministry of National Education’s inconsistent needs analysis, offering of the PD/INSETs, and top-down nature of PD/INSETs that are not really geared toward practicing EFL teachers also contribute to the failure of PD/INSETs.
5. Novice and female teachers were found to be more enthusiastic about attending the PD/INSETs.
6. Majority of the teachers prefer not to participate in seminars and do not find them to be useful. In most of the evaluative studies the tendency toward methodology is quantitative, which also is limiting because they do not provide deeper understanding of the participants’ views and beliefs (Johnson and Christensen 2008). For example, Arikan’s (2004) research study focused on narratives of nine instructors from various universities, which provided a comprehensive understanding of the participants through qualitative interviews, research studies of Turhan and Arikan (2009), Karaaslan (2003), Eksi (2010), and Buyukyavuz and Inal (2008) only used surveys/questionnaires as the main instruments for data collec-
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author and year</th>
<th>Publication type/Methodology</th>
<th>Participants and setting</th>
<th>Findings/Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Arikan A 2004</td>
<td>Article Qualitative narrative study: interview as the only instrument</td>
<td>9 EL instructors from universities</td>
<td>As a result of the interviews that the researcher had conducted there were multiple themes that emerged: 1) Instructors did not have autonomy for PDs offered to the teachers 2) Instructors believed that their position in their PD resembles an empty slate. 3) Instructors wanted to take part in the change rather than being made the subjects of PD 4) Instructors had doubts about the quality of administrators and trainers. 5) Instructors believed that they feel uncomfortable in their observations because they often are superficial, mechanical, and fake events that do not reflect real classroom experiences 6) Although teachers’ trainers often appear to be the authority figure over the teachers, instructors wanted them to have more interpersonal relationship and support them. 7) Instructors disliked the fact that there is a big divide between what works in teachers’ classrooms is not considered to be a valid methodology.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turhan IE, Arikan A 2009</td>
<td>Article Quantitative methodology: questionnaire as an instrument</td>
<td>30 instructors at a preparatory school of a university.</td>
<td>The findings of the pre and post-questionnaire given to instructors resulted in similar findings. The following were highlighted as main findings from the questionnaire responses: 1) The participants believed that INSET courses were part of their PD. 2) Instructors wanted external PD providers and wanted to have PD that allowed reflection. 3) Participants did not like the PD to be obligatory and wanted it to be optional. 4) Novice teachers were more enthusiastic about attending the PD than the experienced teachers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kasapoglu AE 2002</td>
<td>MA Thesis Qualitative methodology: Interviews, peer observations, reflective journals were used as the instruments.</td>
<td>Four teachers-two experienced and two novice who taught at a university preparatory school.</td>
<td>In this pilot study, four teachers engaged in the development of a peer-observation model and reflected upon their experiences of the process. As a result of the peer-observation process, the participants believed that this process contributed positively to their PD.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kanaslan AD 2003</td>
<td>MA Thesis Quantitative-questionnaire used as an instrument.</td>
<td>110 English language instructors at a university preparatory school.</td>
<td>As a result of the descriptive analysis of the questionnaire the researcher reached the following findings: 1) Participants thought that PD was important for their growth. 2) Peer-observation and action research were not favored by participants. 3) PD was more important for female and inexperienced teachers. 4) The obstacles that prevented teachers from participation into PDs were excessive workload, lack of self-motivation, and institutional support.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eksi G 2010</td>
<td>MA Thesis Quantitative-survey research</td>
<td>92 instructors teaching at university preparatory school.</td>
<td>As a result of the descriptive analysis of the questionnaire given to participants the following results were presented by the researcher: 1) Instructors believed in the importance of PD. 2) The most common form of PD that instructors attended were informal discussions with colleagues and...</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 1: Contd...

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author and year</th>
<th>Publication type</th>
<th>Methodology</th>
<th>Participants and setting</th>
<th>Findings/Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sahin V 2006</td>
<td>PhD Dissertation</td>
<td>Mixed methodology: Questionnaires, interviews, observations, student work</td>
<td>6 trainees, 2 trainers, and 2 chairpersons of the department at the university, and the students of the trainees and non-trainees,</td>
<td>self-reflection. 3) The inconvenience of dates and times and unrealistic content were the most common excuses for non-attendance in the PDs. 4) The more experienced teachers were found to be the ones who were less interested in participation in PDs. The results of the study reported the researchers’ findings of the assessment of the Certificate of Teaching English (CTE) program at the university. According to the findings, although CTE program was effective there needed to be improvements made to the program. The researcher also used Kirkpatrick’s model for program evaluation, which was found to be ineffective for the assessment of the particular CTE program.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2: Impact studies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author and year</th>
<th>Publication type</th>
<th>Methodology</th>
<th>Participants and setting</th>
<th>Findings/Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Atay D 2008</td>
<td>Article</td>
<td>Qualitative research: narratives and journals used as instruments</td>
<td>62 teachers at a preparatory school of a university</td>
<td>The research included a PD program teaching teachers how to do research in their classrooms led by the researcher. As a result of the six-week PD the teachers conducted classroom research and reported their experiences. The main themes from their experiences were: 1) Increased knowledge in research skills 2) Increased awareness of the teaching/learning process 3) Renewed enthusiasm about teaching 4) Collaboration with colleagues 5) Struggles with research.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arikan N 2002</td>
<td>MA Thesis</td>
<td>Qualitative study- pre-questionnaire, meeting recordings, interviews, field notes, and participant’s reflective journals were used as instruments</td>
<td>13 English language teachers at a university preparatory school</td>
<td>This study reported the initial process of a teacher-study group (TSG) at a university preparatory school. The results indicated that the formation of the TSG was a productive PD for teachers, which allowed them to share their experiences with their colleagues as well as engaged in PD that they wouldn’t be able to otherwise.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sabuncuglo O 2006</td>
<td>PhD Dissertation</td>
<td>Quantitative study-questionnaire that asked satisfaction of instructors about PD</td>
<td>250 English instructors from 17 universities in Turkey participated in the study.</td>
<td>As a result of the analyses of the questionnaire about whether they were satisfied or not satisfied with their initial or pre-service education resulted in: 1) The participants were not satisfied with their initial teacher education. 2) Half of them were not confident about PD. 3) Although teachers felt confident about knowledge of grammar, they did not know how to express it in a communicative way. 4) Teachers believed that experience alone is not sufficient for the growth of a teacher. 5) Majority of the teachers prefer not to participate in seminars and do not find them to be useful.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alan B 2003</td>
<td>MA Thesis</td>
<td>Mixed methodology- quantitative surveys and semi-structured interviews were conducted.</td>
<td>17 novice teachers at a university preparatory school participated in this research.</td>
<td>This research reported the novice teachers’ perceptions of a 10-week INSET program at the university. The results were as follows: 1) The workshops on classroom management, testing, speaking, a teaching and testing grammar were most useful. While teaching reading and vocabulary and material development as least helpful 2) Although the INSET program was helpful, it was suggested that future INSET should focus on more contextual knowledge.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Duzan CU 2006</td>
<td>MA Thesis</td>
<td>Mixed methodology-questionnaire and interviews with participants</td>
<td>12 teachers/trainees and 4 teachers trainers, and 45 experienced teachers from a university preparatory school participated in this research.</td>
<td>This research reported results of the evaluation of the effectiveness of the in-service teacher-training program implemented for newly hire teachers. The results indicated that the trainees needed to improve their teaching skills, therefore the new PD was helpful in helping them to do that, while the experienced teachers did not feel the need to enroll in the in-service training program. As for the teacher-trainers, they were satisfied with the in-service program and provided some suggestions for improvement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unal D 2010</td>
<td>MA Thesis</td>
<td>Mixed methodology- pre-and-post-survey done at the beginning and end of the training, and semi-structured interviews with 10 teachers.</td>
<td>10 newly hired and 12 experienced teachers at the university’s English preparatory school participated in this research.</td>
<td>This study looked at the implementation and the effectiveness of a new INSET program for teachers at a university preparatory school. According to the results, novice teachers’ and experienced teachers’ needs were different from each other but they were overall satisfied with the INSET program.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3: Evaluative studies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author and year</th>
<th>Publication type</th>
<th>Methodology</th>
<th>Participants and setting</th>
<th>Findings/Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kucuk suleymanoglu R 2006</td>
<td>Article</td>
<td>Mixed methodology- questionnaires for participating teachers and interviews with instructors were held.</td>
<td>186 teachers and 5 instructors participate in this research.</td>
<td>This study presented the number of INSET activities provided by the Ministry of Education, the views of ELT teachers who participated in these activities and the views of the instructors who participated in the INSET. The results indicated that: 1) There were only 122 INSET programs geared toward ELT from 1998-2005. 2) The interviews with the instructors indicated that the INSET courses were not consistently offered, the curricula were the same and dictated by the ministry, the courses were not separated by the grade level, and needs analysis were not conducted before the courses. 3) The teachers' attitudes about the INSET was that because the needs of the participants were varied the aims of the program were not suitable to participants, their satisfaction and perceptions about the programs also differed due to the mixed grouping of teachers in INSET programs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buyukyavuz O, Inal S 2008</td>
<td>Article</td>
<td>Quantitative research methodology was used- questionnaire was used as the main instrument.</td>
<td>132 Turkish teachers of English</td>
<td>The main aim of this research study was to determine the main sources of information used by EFL teachers in Turkey in order to professionally develop themselves and to find out their need for professional development and the resources available to them at their workplaces. Only 26 out of the 132 teachers subscribed to professional journals, 52% of the teachers regularly watched TV and 89% of the teachers had library designed for English teaching at home, in order to receive professional knowledge 24% of the teachers conferred with experienced friends, 89% of the teachers indicated that they benefited from latest developments in the field and 31% of the teachers did not use the internet as a source of knowledge. The topics that the teachers found to be less interested were research skills, testing techniques, learner autonomy, and NLP. The available resources at their workplaces were noted as audio-visual materials. Interestingly that the teachers did not consider in-service seminars offered by the ministry of education to be effective sources of knowledge.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iyidogan F 2011 MA Thesis</td>
<td>Qualitative- interviews were used as the primary instruments</td>
<td>6 experienced English teachers in primary and secondary schools in two different cities</td>
<td></td>
<td>The aim of this research was to find out the reasons why teachers decide to participate or not participate in PD activities. The results indicated that: 1) All participants agreed upon the importance of PD toward their professional growth. 2) Being married and having children did not have a large impact on their decision to attend PDs. 3) Teachers with over 20 years of experience had negative attitudes toward PDs. 4) The salary is not an indicator of a decision to attend PDs.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3: Contd...

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author and year</th>
<th>Publication type</th>
<th>Methodology</th>
<th>Participants and setting</th>
<th>Findings/Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Unal E 2010</td>
<td>MA Thesis</td>
<td>Mixed methodology—questionnaires and interviews with teachers.</td>
<td>150 EFL teachers and 50 school administrators</td>
<td>The aim of this research was to find out how INSET programs are designed and how teachers and administrators conceptualize these programs in Turkey. The results indicated that: 1) The INSET programs designed by the ministry of education are mandatory for all teachers. 2) Many teachers are willing to participate in INSET however they dislike the fact that they are often compulsory. 3) The two major obstacles that teachers mention for non-attendance in INSET are inconvenient location and time. 4) A significant number of teachers thought that INSET programs “never” meet their needs. 5) Teachers indicated a need for INSET programs in Computer-based language teaching, education programs abroad, speaking, using drama in FLT, and evaluation and development of course materials. 6) Administrators also believed that INSETs are not designed specifically for teachers' needs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Author and year</td>
<td>Publication type</td>
<td>Methodology</td>
<td>Participants and setting</td>
<td>Findings/Results</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Atay D 2001</td>
<td>PhD Dissertation</td>
<td>Mixed methodology-experimental and control groups in quantitative and semi-structured interviews.</td>
<td>40 teachers- 20 public and 20 private schools and 20 students from ELT department of a university</td>
<td>This study examined the collaborative dialogue and knowledge transmission between student teachers and supervising teachers in schools. The results indicated that: 1) Supervising teachers in experimental group showed a significant growth in many of the teaching practices.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Atay D 2004</td>
<td>Article</td>
<td>Mixed methodology-in-service training sessions, semi-structured interviews, and observations were conducted.</td>
<td>Twenty English teachers from public and private schools and twenty student teachers from the university participated in this study.</td>
<td>The aim of the research was to investigate the effects of a collaborative dialogue with student-teachers as a follow-up to training and development based-INSET that focused on the PD and classroom practices of cooperating teachers (CT). The results indicated that 1) CTs reported that they gained awareness of their own teaching, they were able to incorporate theoretical knowledge into practice, and their enthusiasm was renewed as a result of the collaborative dialogue with student teachers (ST). 2) The CTs developed their skills on asking genuine questions and reacting to messages more effectively.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Atay D 2006</td>
<td>Article</td>
<td>Qualitative methodology- Journals kept by pre-service teachers, informal talks with in-service teachers and researcher field-notes.</td>
<td>10 pre-service teachers and 10 in-service teachers participated in the study.</td>
<td>The aim of the research was to find out how does collaborative action research affect the professional competence of pre and in-service teachers. The results of the research indicated that: 1) In-service teachers’ perceptions about research changed, they gained increased awareness of their own teaching, and they gained appreciation for collaboration. 2) In addition to teachers’ gained knowledge the PTs also indicated that they also enriched their knowledge through this collaboration.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daloglu A 2004</td>
<td>Article</td>
<td>Mixed methodology: Quantitative questionnaire at the end of the PD for teachers, then interviews were conducted on the effectiveness of the program.</td>
<td>45 teachers teaching in the primary grades (1-5) and the researcher at a private school</td>
<td>The results of this research were: 1) teachers appreciated and found the PD useful2) Teachers felt like they benefited from the PD program3) Teachers also felt that administrators were supportive of the PD4) Teachers also felt that they grew as a professionals and gained self-confidence through the program5) The communication among the teachers have also improved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ortactepe P 2006</td>
<td>MA Thesis</td>
<td>Quantitative-Teachers Background Questionnaire, English teachers Sense of Efficacy Scale, Communicative Orientation of Language Teaching Observation Scheme and questionnaire were used as primary instruments.</td>
<td>0 EFL teachers 5 from 8 private schools participated in this study.</td>
<td>The aim of this research was to find out the relationship between Turkish EFL teachers’ efficacy and their self-reported practice of CLT and whether an in-service education program had an impact on their PD in terms of teachers’ efficacy and their self-reported and observed practice of CLT. The results indicated that: 1) The INSET program provided enhanced teachers’ efficacy and self-reported practice of CLT.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ozcalli S 2007</td>
<td>MA Thesis</td>
<td>Mixed methodology: Questionnaires, interviews and teachers journals were used</td>
<td>25 in-service teachers from 5 private schools</td>
<td>The purpose of the study was to analyze the relationship between teacher efficacy and reflective thinking, and the impact of an in-service education program on it. The results showed that 1) The</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 4: Contd...

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author and year</th>
<th>Publication type</th>
<th>Methodology</th>
<th>Participants and setting</th>
<th>Findings/Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Surmeli EC 2004</td>
<td>PhD Dissertation</td>
<td>Qualitative methodology - interviews, repertory grids, questionnaires and reflection sheets were used as primary instruments in this research.</td>
<td>6 EFL teachers from state schools participated in this research.</td>
<td>INSET program increased teachers' level of efficacy. 2) Journal writing was thought to be beneficial for EFL teachers' practices. The aim of this research was to investigate the effects of NLP techniques on the personal and PD of EFL teachers and to see whether NLP techniques enabled teachers to develop a system of support for themselves to cope with problems with their personal and professional life. The results indicated that: 1) Teacher development opportunities in Turkey are found to be very limited. 2) They can't meet the needs of experienced EFL teachers. 3) The NLP teacher development program enabled teachers to discover their subjective world and connect personal and professional theories, therefore proved to be an important step toward a successful INSET. 4) Teachers' views on content and structure also shifted through the repertory grid.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kirazlar C 2007</td>
<td>MA Thesis</td>
<td>Mixed: Attitude scale questionnaire toward teaching profession. Reflective Practice questionnaire. Structured diary and interviews were also used as primary instruments.</td>
<td>27 primary school EFL schools from 16 schools.</td>
<td>The aim of this research was to determine the reflective practice of primary school EFL teachers in Canakkale. The second aim was to introduce reflective teaching through the use of a diary in a study, to determine teachers' progress on reflective practices. The results of the study were: 1) Teachers still carried traditional reflection methods like exams, lesson notes. 2) Teachers do not have highly positive toward teaching profession. 3) The diary keeping study was slightly effective toward positive change of teachers' attitudes toward teaching profession. 4) Teachers started to observe and question their teaching through the use of diaries, therefore created new techniques in their classrooms.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
tion. In educational research, qualitative research methodology is helpful in understanding the participants' lived experiences through their points of views (Creswell 2009).

Additionally in all of the research that were evaluative, the research only brought forth the issues rather than offering solutions to the issues. In educational research, it is widely popular to point attention to issues but as long as there are not solutions offered, it is unfruitful and does not extend beyond having an understanding of the issues.

Contrary to the evaluative studies, the studies that involved impacted results provided a real-life experience and collaboration among researchers and practitioners (Atay 2008, 2006, 2004, 2001; Arikan 2002; Alan 2003). Atay’s (2006; 2008) and Arikan’s (2002) research involved the use of narratives and journals kept by participants teachers, which allowed for extensive description of participants’ experiences with a specific PD/INSET they were involved in. As a result of impact studies the results were mutually beneficial. The research that engaged both universities and schools in collaboration often resulted in success, therefore universities need to collaborate more with public and private schools.

Another feature of impact studies was the use of mixed methodology through various types of data collection. The use of both quantitative and qualitative method to research provided a rich understanding of the phenomenon under study (Creswell 2009). The combination of questionnaires/surveys and interviews, diaries, and reflective journals allowed researchers to gain an in-depth understanding of participants’ real-life experiences toward PD/INSET, and brought awareness to practitioners regarding their professions (Alan 2003; Unal 2010; Dalgıç 2004; Ozcalı 2007; Kirazlar 2007). Among all mixed methodologies applied to the studies, the biggest impact was for teachers to be able to reassess their professional identities, reflect on what they may have been missing, and take a step forward toward improving their classroom practices.

Another fruitful result of impact studies is the realization of the importance of collaboration among practitioner peers and university personnel. Among the impact studies surveyed in this review, the results indicated that the participant teachers appreciated the collaborative manner of the PD/INSET that they were involved in and realized the benefits of peer-collaboration and feedback in their professional development experiences (Atay 2001, 2004, 2006; Kirazlar 2007; Ozcalı 2007).

**CONCLUSION**

The general goals of this systematic review were to determine the previously conducted research articles, thesis and dissertations about PD or INSETs of EFL teachers in Turkey; to review and discuss the impact and implications of the previously conducted research; and to offer recommendations and suggestions for future research in this area.

To conduct this research several databases such as ISI web of Knowledge and YOK were scanned with Boolean Key Words selected for the purposes of this study. After the in depth analysis of the databases and readings, 30 articles, thesis and dissertations were selected to be examined. The publications were read thoroughly and coded under different categories and themes. The two researchers crosschecked the coding scheme for consistency. The various researches were presented and discussed under different categories and themes.

**LIMITATIONS**

Despite the aforementioned limitations, the results of this systematic literature review should serve as a lens to future research in the area of...
EFL teachers’ PD/INSET. As clearly stated in the review, there is limited research in the field and there is a large need to fill this gap. The following implications should be taken into consideration for further research:

1. PD/INSET topics and the real needs of teachers must be met through the PD/INSET sessions. Thus, future planning of PD/INSETs should take into consideration the teachers’ input.

2. The PD/INSET should be carefully planned and offered regularly and consistently instead of a one-shot sessions.

3. The PD/INSET should be designed and separated among different proficiencies and grade levels such as primary and secondary.

4. Teachers should be given an opportunity to evaluate and reflect on the participated PD/INSET programs.

5. There should be incentives for teachers to participate in PD/INSET programs.

6. There needs to be more research offering PD/INSET programs and looking at its impact.

7. The Ministry of National Education shall appoint personnel (coordinators) responsible for planning and implementation of PD/INSET programs for specific subject areas such as English language teachers. These coordinators shall be practitioners with experience from the field.

8. Teachers should be encouraged to form professional development communities among themselves within the locale of their own schools instead of waiting for others to do it for them.

REFERENCES


Atay D 2004. Collaborative dialogue with student teachers as a follow-up to teacher in-service education and training. Language Teaching Research, 8: 143-162.


Kirazlar C 2007. An Investigation into the Professional Development of Primary School English Language Teachers: The Effects of Keeping Diaries on Teacher Reflection and Attitudes towards Teaching. Master's
OECD DT 2005. OECD Türkiye Temel Eğitim Politikaları İncelemesi Hakkinda Not. [Note for Investigating Main Turkish Education Policies].